

**To:** Singer, Joshua[Singer.Joshua@epa.gov]; Smith, Molly[Smith.Molly@epa.gov]; Marshall, Sarah[marshall.sarah@epa.gov]  
**From:** Alex Ruppenthal  
**Sent:** Mon 6/26/2017 4:00:33 PM  
**Subject:** RE: New S.H. Bell manganese data / "Chicago Tonight" story

Hi Josh,

Thanks for the note. Here are a few specific questions I have:

- According to data sent by S.H. Bell to the Natural Resources Defense Council, concentrations of ambient manganese near S.H. Bell's Chicago facility averaged 0.23 and 0.21 milligrams per cub liter during March and April, respectively. Can you verify the accuracy of this data?
- Does the EPA have data indicating the average concentration of ambient manganese near S.H. Bell's Chicago facility for May 2017? If so, what is it?
- The EPA states the following on its website regarding S.H. Bell: "EPA will be closely analyzing the data generated by these monitors to assess whether the facility is causing a threat to public health and to ensure compliance with the Clean Air Act."  
(<https://www.epa.gov/il/sh-bell-chicago-facility>). Based on the air monitoring data collected since March 1, does the EPA consider the emission of manganese dust from S.H. Bell's Chicago facility as "a threat to public health"? Also, does the new air monitoring data affect S.H. Bell's compliance status with the Clean Air Act?
- Does the new air monitoring data in any way affect S.H. Bell's compliance status with the EPA/federal government?
- Is S.H. Bell's Chicago facility currently in compliance with all EPA regulations? If not, for which reasons is S.H. Bell noncompliant?
- How much data (how many months of data) will be required for the EPA to determine whether S.H. Bell's emission of manganese dust is causing a threat to public health?
- An attorney with the Natural Resources Defense Council said based on the new air monitoring data, the emission of manganese dust from S.H. Bell's Chicago facility now represents an "imminent and substantial endangerment" to the community that could amount to legal action against the company. Has the EPA classified the manganese emissions at S.H. Bell's facility as an "imminent and substantial endangerment"? What recourse, if any, is the EPA considering against S.H. Bell?

Thank you as always for your help.

Best,

Alex

**From:** Singer, Joshua [mailto:Singer.Joshua@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Monday, June 26, 2017 10:25 AM  
**To:** Alex Ruppenthal; Smith, Molly; Marshall, Sarah  
**Subject:** Re: New S.H. Bell manganese data / "Chicago Tonight" story

Alex,

Thanks for the email. We will try, but may not be able to respond by your deadline of this afternoon. Are there any other questions you have? Thanks again.

Josh

---

**From:** Alex Ruppenthal <[aruppenthal@wttw.com](mailto:aruppenthal@wttw.com)>  
**Sent:** Friday, June 23, 2017 5:08:10 PM  
**To:** Singer, Joshua; Smith, Molly; Marshall, Sarah  
**Subject:** New S.H. Bell manganese data / "Chicago Tonight" story

Dear EPA staff,

Hi, my name is Alex Ruppenthal, and I cover environmental issues for the website of "Chicago Tonight" at WTTW.

I'm working on a story to update the situation at S.H. Bell's facility in Chicago, now that the company and the EPA have collected several months of air monitoring data. According to data published online by the EPA, along with data shared by S.H. Bell with a source of mine from the Natural Resources Defense Council, concentrations of ambient manganese near S.H. Bell averaged 0.23 and 0.21 milligrams per cub liter during March and April, respectively. Both averages are more than four times the EPA's reference concentration for manganese of 0.05 milligrams per cubic liter.

NRDC says the new data raises concerns about the health of nearby residents, many of them children. An NRDC attorney said the situation now represents an "imminent and substantial endangerment," the EPA's requirement for initiating legal action against violators under the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act.

I'm hoping to connect with someone from the EPA on Monday to ask some questions for our story. Would someone from the agency be available then to talk with me over the phone?

We are planning to publish the story on our website Monday afternoon.

Please feel free to call me at 773-509-5623, my number at WTTW.

Thank you in advance for your help, and I look forward to hearing from you.

Best regards,

Alex Ruppenthal

---

Alex Ruppenthal | Digital Reporter, *Chicago Tonight*

wtw

5400 N St Louis Ave | Chicago IL 60625

t: 773.509.5623

e: [aruppenthal@wtw.com](mailto:aruppenthal@wtw.com)

[Facebook](#) | [Twitter](#)